

Comparison of Total Costs (3-Year Rental + Buyout)

The total cost of ownership for the three-year rental term (2025–2027) plus the Village Buy Option in 2028 varies between proposals due to differences in pricing, discounts, and buyout structures:

Metric	September 16, 2025, Proposal (Recommended)	September 24, 2025, Proposal (Lowest Cost Revision)
2025 Annual Subtotal	\$60,550.00	\$53,897.00
Total 3-Year Rental (2025–2027)	\$190,605.00	\$168,574.00
Buyout Cost (Year 4, 2028)	Flat-rate buyout of \$10,000.00	Standard 15% buyout of \$25,286.10
Total 4-Year Cost (Rental + Buyout)	\$200,605.00	\$193,860.10

While the September 24th proposal reduces the four-year cost by approximately \$6,744.00, staff identified significant tradeoffs in value and scope.

Value Assessment and Item Inclusions

I. Cost Components and Discounts

1. **Client Discount:** The \$60,550 proposal included a \$10,000 client discount. The \$53,897 revision removed this discount.
2. **Buyout Savings:** The \$60,550 proposal offered a flat-rate buyout of \$10,000, saving \$18,590.75 compared to the standard 15% buyout (\$28,590.75). The \$53,897 revision reverted to the standard 15% buyout (\$25,286.10), increasing costs by \$15,286.10 over the flat-rate option.

II. Decorative Items and Scope of Work

The main tradeoff in the lower-cost revision was a significant reduction in decorative elements, particularly at Harbor Island Park:

Item/Category	September 16, 2025 Proposal (\$60,550)	September 24, 2025 Proposal (\$53,897)
Mamaroneck Ave (Pole Mounts/Garlands)	Included	Included
Harbor Island Park Trees	Two fully lit Deluxe Trees (22' and 16')	One 22' Deluxe Tree
Harbor Island Additional Decor	Santa Throne, fifteen 14" garlands, three structural presents (small, medium, large), two organic candy canes (6' & 9'), two Santa Elves	All eliminated
Complimentary Menorah	Included (6', valued at \$2,500)	Eliminated

The removed items in the \$53,897 proposal were valued at approximately \$16,500.

Staff Recommendation: Best Value for the Money

Staff recommends proceeding with the \$60,550 proposal for year one, based on the following rationale:

1. **Nominal Cost Difference:** The total four-year cost differs by only \$6,744 (\$1,686 per year), which is minor compared to the overall project cost adds holiday lighting elements to the harbor.
2. **Balanced Value:** It balances cost savings with maintaining the quality and visual impact of the holiday display.
3. **Preserves Key Elements:** It retains essential decorative elements at Harbor Island Park's entrance and pavilion.
4. **Maintains Full Scope:** Includes the full range of original items, including the complimentary 6' menorah, and preserves the \$10,000 client discount.

5. **Maximizes Overall Value:** Leveraging Village staff for installation and retaining the flat \$10,000 buyout achieves significant savings while maintaining the integrity and appeal of the display.

The \$60,550 proposal represents the most cost-effective option among all submissions, delivering a visually impressive holiday experience at a substantially reduced cost.